

Proposal Evaluation Summary

Design Services for Ellis Harbor Sidewalk Repairs – RFP #PUR0118-117

Proposals opened February 27, 2018

Evaluators: Steve Krug, Doug Wilson, Glen Shultz

Proposals received in alphabetical order:

Firm Name	Location	Financial Proposal	Score
All Trans, Inc.	Cedar Rapids, IA	\$14,960	723.33
Fehr Graham	Cedar Rapids, IA	\$30,600	not scored*
Hall & Hall Engineering, LLC	Hiawatha, IA	\$26,978	746.67
HBK Engineering, LLC	Cedar Rapids, IA	\$20,135	963.33
McClure Engineering Co.	Cedar Rapids, IA	\$24,950	750.00
Norton & Schmidt	North Kansas City, MO	\$39,500	not scored*
Watersmith Engineering	Cedar Rapids, IA	\$12,000	873.33
YTT Design Solution, LLC	Cedar Rapids, IA	\$14,900	1066.67

*Proposal not scored due to budget

Top three ranked firms:

1. YTT Design Solutions, LLC

Criteria	Points
Qualifications and Experience (40%)	386.67
Proposed Cost - see page 2 (30%)	270.00
Responsiveness (30%)	290.00
Local Preference Points	100.00
Small Business Preference Points	20.00
Total Evaluation Points	1066.67

Facts:

- Firm possesses all required experience
- Proposal clearly presents specific experience of the individual team members who would be assigned to this project, including experience on previous City projects
- Financial proposal is very competitive
- Clear understanding of project with detailed timeline that meets City’s desired schedule

2. HBK Engineering, LLC

Criteria	Points
Qualifications and Experience (40%)	373.33
Proposed Cost - see page 2 (30%)	210.00
Responsiveness (30%)	280.00
Local Preference Points	100.00
Small Business Preference Points	
Total Evaluation Points	963.33

Facts:

- Firm possesses all required experience
- Proposal clearly presents specific experience of the individual team members who would be assigned to this project, including experience on City ADA projects
- Financial proposal is in competitive range
- Clear understanding of project anticipated to be completed within City’s desired schedule

3. Watersmith Engineering

Criteria	Points
Qualifications and Experience (40%)	253.33
Proposed Cost - see page 2 (30%)	290.00
Responsiveness (30%)	230.00
Local Preference Points	100.00
Small Business Preference Points	
Total Evaluation Points	873.33

Facts:

- Firm possesses all required experience
- Proposal clearly presents experience of the individual team members who would be assigned to this project
- Financial proposal is very competitive
- Clear understanding of project with detailed timeline that meets City's desired schedule

Recommendation for Award:

Of the 8 responsive proposals, the evaluation team scored the 6 proposals within the budget and YTT Design Solutions was rated as the top proposal.